


**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA  
INTER-OFFICE MEMORANDUM  
PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES**

**DATE:** July 20, 2010 **FILE:** 10-C-53

**TO:** Historic Preservation Board

**VIA:** Julie Walls Krolak, Principal Planner 

**FROM:** Elizabeth Chang, Planning and Development Services Administrator 

**SUBJECT:** Bruce Gross requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for exterior renovations to an existing single-family home located at 1101 N. Southlake Drive in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

**APPLICANT REQUEST**

Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovations to an existing single family home.

**STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design:

- Approval, for replacement of windows, with the condition a Unity of Title, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney, be submitted prior to the issuance of permits and recorded in the Broward County Public Records prior to Certificate of Completion (C/C).
- Denial, for exterior renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

**BACKGROUND**

According to information provided by the Broward County Property Appraiser, the house was constructed in 1949. Characteristic of Post War Modern, Ranch style architecture, this home was built during a time following World War II. During this period, Ranch homes were rapidly constructed to accommodate a wave of new residents to South Florida. With the need for quick, inexpensive, and efficient housing, traditional residential architectural styles were abandoned. Instead, these new Ranch homes included architectural features such as asymmetrical massing with horizontal emphasis to windows and low-pitched roofs. With minimal ornamentation, entrances were not typically emphasized. Furthermore, materials used included stucco, concrete tile roofs, and aluminum windows.

The home was designed by Guy Platt Johnson in 1948, as stated on the original plans provided by the architect. (Attachment A) Research performed by staff revealed that Guy Platt Johnson was born in Tampa in 1888 and worked as an architect in Fort Lauderdale starting in 1938. He is noted as the architect for the Maxwell Hotel, Fort Lauderdale, in an article in the *Fort Lauderdale Times* in 1940.



## PROPOSED PROJECT

The existing one-story home is approximately 2,100 sq ft and is on two lots, approximately 0.31 acres. Additionally, the home is uniquely situated in the Historic District on a double-fronted lot, located along South 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue between Van Buren Street and N. Southlake Drive. While the address of the property is N. Southlake Drive, the main entrance of the home is designed to face Van Buren Street. Homeowners are allowed to request the establishment of a front yard for properties on double-fronted lots, and design criteria were established in 2001 in order to address this specific issue. These criteria allowed for identification of one front yard and one rear yard and included the following:

1. The front of the property shall face the same direction as the main entrance to the dwelling unit.
2. The rear of the property shall have attributes common to rear properties such as accessory structures (pools, sheds, etc...)
3. The establishment of a front yard shall not create non-conformities, such as accessory structure in the front yard.

The applicant is requesting to alter the design of the home for the main elevation to face N. Southlake Drive in order to match the address of the property. Additionally, the applicant has expressed the desire to utilize the north side (Van Buren) as the rear yard due to the amount of open space. In order to facilitate this request, the applicant is proposing a new covered entry feature on the south to emphasize it as the main elevation. Design modifications also include replacement of all windows, closing one window opening (north), expanding two openings for double doors (north and south), and reducing four window openings (south). (Attachment A) All proposed windows will be single hung and match the existing design allowing for compatibility with the building's historic appearance. The existing north elevation will continue to contain original stonework, preserving the home's character. However, with the proposed exterior renovations of the new entry feature (south) and double French doors (north), the proposed design results in re-orientation of the home.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing and location for all properties within the district. According to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, "*Entrances and porches are quite often the focus of historic buildings, particularly on primary elevations. Together with their functional and decorative features such as doors, steps, balustrades, pilasters, and entablatures, they can be extremely important in defining the overall character of a building.*" Furthermore, it does not recommend removing an entrance or porch because the building has been re-oriented to accommodate a new house, as well as, cutting new entrances on a primary elevation.

While replacement of the windows is sensitive to the existing design, alteration of the front and rear are inconsistent with established criteria for double-fronted lots. The proposed renovations associated with re-orientation of the front and rear is inconsistent with the character of the Historic Lakes Section and has not been designed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards or the Design Guidelines.



## SITE BACKGROUND

**Applicants/Owners:** Bruce Gross  
**Address/Location:** 1101 N. Southlake Drive  
**Size of Property:** approximately 0.31 acres  
**Present Zoning:** Single Family Residential (RS-6)  
Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)  
**Present Land Use:** Single Family Residence  
**Year Built:** 1949 (Broward County Property Appraiser)

## ADJACENT ZONING

**North:** Single Family Residential District (RS-6)  
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)  
**South:** Single Family Residential District (RS-9)  
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)  
**East:** Single Family Residential District (RS-6)  
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)  
**West:** Single Family Residential District (RS-6)  
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to "promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property." While the proposed window replacement is consistent with the goals of the Comprehensive Plan, the request to re-orient the home is not consistent with the Design Guidelines.

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed replacement of windows will allow the applicant to make the necessary improvements while maximizing the use of their property. However, renovations associated with re-orientation of the home are not sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design. The existing elevations are sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which is similar to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

*Policy CW.15: Place a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

*Policy 2.46 encourages the preservation of stable neighborhoods and rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states "the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements." The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape without interference with the existing landscaping.



## CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

*The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.*

The proposed renovations associated with re-orientation of the home affect the integrity of the Historic District by changing the appearance of this Post War Modern, Ranch style home. Existing architectural features should be maintained and its existing design is consistent with the surrounding neighborhood.

### DECISIONS ON CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR DESIGN

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for new building construction, additions to existing building, major renovation work or substantial alteration shall be based upon evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with and adherence to the criteria for designation listed in § 5.6.F.

**Criteria:** integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association.

#### CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts recommends *consistent spacing and setback*. Additionally, the Guidelines further recommend having the *main entrance oriented to the street and site coverage similar to adjacent lots*. The home is uniquely situated in the Historic District on a double-fronted lot, located along S. 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue between Van Buren Street and N. Southlake Drive. While the address of the property is N. Southlake Drive, the main entrance of the home is designed to face Van Buren Street. The property is located on two lots, approximately 0.31 acres. Setbacks of the building will be maintained; however, proposed renovations results in re-orientation of the main entrance.

**FINDING:** Consistent, for replacement of windows.  
Inconsistent, for renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

#### CRITERION: DESIGN

**ANALYSIS:** The Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts recommend *protection of architectural details and features that contribute to the character of the building*. It further states *to avoid introducing new window and door openings into elevations, or enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock windows or new door sizes*. Scope of work includes replacement of all windows, in addition to exterior renovations which will result in re-orientation of the home. Associated with this request is enlarging and reducing several openings. While the request for replacement of windows is consistent with the existing design, the request to alter the front and rear elevations is not sensitive to the character of the neighborhood and architectural style of the home.



As stated by the architect, "The new owner wishes to replace the single entrance door on the south with a pair of doors to emphasize its importance as the main entrance. A pair of French doors will replace a pair of windows on the north elevation in anticipation of the addition of a swimming pool, fencing, and landscaping for privacy." The existing north elevation serves as the main entrance of the home and contains original stonework. In order to preserve the home's character, this architectural feature should remain intact.

**FINDING:** Consistent, for replacement of windows.  
Inconsistent, for renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

**CRITERION:** SETTING

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines state *setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood*. When making alterations or additions it is recommended *distinctive features such as size, mass, color, and materials of buildings are retained*. The property is located on two lots, approximately 0.31 acres. Renovations include alteration of the front and rear in order to re-orient the home. Additional improvements include replacement of all windows to single hung which is consistent with the existing design and surrounding neighborhood. In order to preserve the existing setting and comply with this criterion, **staff is recommending the condition the applicant provide a Unity of Title**. However, the proposed entry feature, as well as inclusion of double French doors, alters the size and mass of the north and south elevations which is inconsistent with this criterion. Work associated with re-orientation of the home is incompatible with the building's historic appearance resulting in a potential loss of its historic character.

**FINDING:** Consistent, for replacement of windows and with imposition of staff's condition.  
Inconsistent, for renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

**CRITERION:** MATERIALS

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts state *materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place*. Furthermore, *materials that are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used*. *Designing new work which is incompatible with the other buildings in the neighborhood in materials, size, scale, and texture should be avoided*.

The applicant is proposing exterior renovations which includes altering the front and rear elevations, replacing all windows in the home, as well as, closing one window opening (north), expanding two openings for double doors (north and south), and reducing four window openings (south). Materials used are consistent with the design of the existing home and compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts state to *avoid imitating a style or period that detracts from the architectural unity of an ensemble or group*. Proposed renovations include a new entry feature (south) and double French doors (north). While consistent with architectural features of the home, the proposed entry feature will alter the front and rear elevations. Furthermore, the use of French doors is inconsistent with the current design of the home. Included in the scope of work is replacing all windows in the home, all of which will match the existing design. While the replacement of windows is consistent, renovations associated with re-orientation of the home are not consistent with the character of the Historic Lakes Section and have not been designed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards or the Design Guidelines.

FINDING: Consistent, for replacement of windows.  
Inconsistent, for renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts recommend avoiding incorporating elements which are incompatible with other buildings in the neighborhood in materials, size, scale, and texture. While the proposed windows are consistent with other properties in the neighborhood, alterations of the elevations and openings have affected the character of the home and thus, altered its association with surrounding properties.

FINDING: Consistent, for replacement of windows.  
Inconsistent, for renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

## RECOMMENDATION

### Certificate of Appropriateness for Design:

Approval, for replacement of windows, with the condition a Unity of Title, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney, be submitted prior to the issuance of permits and recorded in the Broward County Public Records prior to Certificate of Completion (C/C).

Denial, for exterior renovations associated with re-orientation of front and rear.

## ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package  
ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph